

December 17, 2013

ERIE COUNTY COUNCIL – Regular Meeting

Mr. Giles, Chairman, called to order a Regular Meeting of the Erie County Council at 7:00 p.m. at the Erie County Council Chambers, Erie County Courthouse, Erie, Pennsylvania. Following the Pledge of Allegiance, Mrs. Loll recited the following prayer:

“Let us pray. Lord it is Christmas season, we wish that it lasted all year. For on Christmas Eve, and Christmas Day, the entire world is a better place, and men and women are more lovable. Love itself seeps into every heart, and miracles happen...we thank you God for Christmas. Amen.”.

Roll Call

The County Clerk called the roll:

Members Present: Mr. Giles, Chairman
Mr. Cleaver, Vice Chairman
Mr. DiMattio
Mr. Fatica
Dr. Foust
Mr. Leone
Mrs. Loll

Members Absent: None.

Also Present: Douglas R. Smith, County Clerk
Joseph Maloney, Council CPA
James Sparber, Director of Finance
Sue Ellen Pasquale, Manager of Accounting
Thomas Talarico, Solicitor

Hearing of the Public

David Mitchell, 124 Chestnut Street, Corry, Pennsylvania. Mr. Mitchell wanted to wish Council a Merry Christmas. He also wanted to say thank you to the two departing members of Council, Mr. Cleaver and Mr. Giles. He stated that Mr. Cleaver has served the County well, came out of retirement, and did a yeoman job as a councilman. Mr. Mitchell appreciated that Mr. Cleaver stepped up to help the southeast corner of the County. Mr. Mitchell stated he could not begin to talk about Mr. Giles because he was time limited, and asked all to think about how much time they have spent listening to Joe Giles. He stated it has all been well worth it and fortunately a lot of times, Mr. Giles was brief. He noted that this Council has served the citizens of Erie County well over the years and noted that Mr. Giles has been a beacon of light for all those years and he had the privilege of serving with him for almost ten years. Mr. Mitchell also commented that Mr. Giles has been a hard worker who has brought millions of dollars into the County that no one will ever recognize, but he has done this County a lot of good and this County has been his mission. He also welcomed the new council members and wished them good luck.

Report by Mr. Leone

Mr. Leone stated the Finance Committee met on Thursday, December 12, 2013, and added to the agenda Ordinance Number 131, 2013 – Children & Youth Fund Budget; Ordinance Number 132, 2013 – Library Fund Supplemental Appropriation; Ordinance Number 133, 2013 – Ninth 2013 Public Health Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation; Ordinance Number 134, 2013 – Thirty-First General Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation; Ordinance Number 135, 2013 – Gaming Fund Budget Revised Expenditure; Ordinance Number 136, 2013 – Library Fund Budget Revised Revenue; Ordinance Number 137, 2013 – Thirty-Second 2013 General Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation; Ordinance Number 138, 2013 – Revised Environment Fee Schedule; Resolution 63, 2013 – Approving the Temporary Solicitor Contract submitted by Tax Assessment and Board of Assessment Appeals; Resolution 64, 2013 – Approving the Cooperation Agreement regarding Lord Corp TIF; Resolution 65, 2013 – Approving a Ten Year Contract between County of Erie and Spaeder Company; Resolution 66, 2013 – Exonerating Taxes on One Abandoned Trailer/Property in McKean; along with the appointments of Renee Wright to the Children &

Youth Advisory Board, Bob Williams to the Redevelopment Authority, Lou Aliota to the Erie County Board of Health, James Veshecco to the Erie County Drug & Alcohol Advisory Board; reappointment of William DeLuca to the Erie County Redevelopment Authority; appointment of Owen McCormick to the Erie County Industrial Development Authority, Barbara Steele to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority, Wayne Howard to the Erie County General Authority and the Erie County Community Service Financing Authority; the reappointment of Charles Augustine to the Erie Regional Airport Authority; reappointment of Helen Carter-Snell to the Children & Youth Advisory Board; reappointment of Charles Peters to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority; and reappointment of Earl Brown to the Erie County Agricultural Preservation Board. Mr. Leone also included the sale of parcels from the repository as listed.

Report by
Dr. Foust

Dr. Foust stated that the Personnel Committee met right after the Finance Committee on Thursday, December 12, 2013. The Personnel Committee agreed to place on the agenda Ordinance Numbers 139 and 140, which deal with the salary of our appointed officials staff, the County Solicitor and County Clerk., as well as Ordinances 141 and 142, which have to do with the reorganization of the Assessment Bureau. All four of these items were discussed to move to second readings.

Mr. Giles'
Report

Mr. Giles stated that on December 17, 2013, at 10 a.m., he, Dr. Foust, and Mr. Leone met with President Judge DiSantis, Tom Aaron – Court Administrator, Sue Ellen Pasquale, Joe Maloney, and Doug Smith. A copy of the CCAP study was distributed at that meeting. This study was completed by Rita Reynolds regarding Erie County's IT system. There is an overview of Erie County and how IT is handled, the strengths, challenges, and series of key findings and recommendations. Mr. Giles stated that the new members of Council, along with the new County Executive, would receive a copy of this so they are aware of what the specific recommendations are from CCAP. Mr. Giles noted that Rita Reynolds has done this type of assessment for other counties throughout the Commonwealth and she completed it in a very professional manner. There was a conference call with Rita to go over the report to be sure we understood what the report encompassed and what the particular focus CCAP was centered on. One recommendation was that there should be a Chief Information Officer as Ms. Reynolds felt that there are a lot of people doing a lot of IT things, but someone who has the depth, breadth, and knowledge to oversee all of that should be considered, and not hiring just a "manager", but someone who has a broader sense of how it should work more efficiently and consistently.

Another recommendation had to do with the phone system. Ms. Reynolds felt that the phone system utilized at CCAP should be considered for Erie County. This is a VoIP system that would save the County anywhere from 25-35% off of the regular phone costs as they are right now.

Mr. Giles expressed the ability to turn County government into a 24/7 operation by using technology to get there is an exciting realization. It helps those citizens who can't get off of work to make a payment at the tax office. While the County is a distance away from that reality, the hope is to make County government service more available and more transparent to the citizens.

Another CCAP initiative is the Intensive Case Management System that will eventually make it possible from the law enforcement first step in the process to the final send off by probation where each of the entities will be linked together so there is no duplication of information. It has been pilot tested in 12 counties and those counties have found the technology extraordinary. This would save every department from the law enforcement piece to the probation piece and create efficiencies in county government that are much needed. The sooner the County moves ahead the better off it will be. Mr. Giles noted that when the salary is set for this "CIO" hire, be sure it is set to attract the most talented technology person available because what is needed is a good technology person who is current and up to date on the most modern available technology, but also a good manager, which is not an easy mix to find. He stated there are 27 different IT employees and the challenge of making a unified IT Department that will be totally responsive to the public, totally responsive to the employees internally, and marketing and branding and imaging Erie County and Erie County services will be a serious challenge moving forward.

December 17, 2013

Mr. Giles'
Report (cont'd)

Mr. Giles then discussed the last board meeting of NaCO, which is typically held in the home county of the current president and for the past five years, they have been southern states, but this year the person, Linda Langston, was from Iowa, so the December board meeting was in Cedar Rapids, Iowa. He stated that the focus of that meeting was on resiliency. He commented that the first 24 hours dealt with what happened with Cedar Rapids (four years ago the river flooded seriously), which devastated the community. Mr. Giles has a one page summary report on that discussion. He added that part of the presentation was by Mr. Bruce Katz who is vice president of the Brookings Institute. His book, *The Metropolitan Revolution*, had been given to Mr. Giles as a member of ECGRA. Mr. Katz gave an hour and a half presentation on economic development. Mr. Katz stated that people are doing the same thing over and over expecting a different outcome. Mr. Giles went on to state that there was discussion regarding a study on poverty. He stated that this is an issue that has been discussed with Erie Together and there are many initiatives all over the country. He felt it was important to keep these things in mind as Council moves forward because these are the freshest things around regarding economic development and poverty and poverty issues. He had the opportunity to interject that the Erie business community put together a scholarship program for preschool so that youngsters who wouldn't have the opportunity to go to preschool could do. The participants in the board meeting were intrigued by the initiative and inquired about obtaining information on how it was done.

Mr. Giles then discussed the magazine "Cyber for Counties", which is a publication put together by NaCO. He then distributed a copy to each member. He went on to explain the value of NaCO and the opportunity he had to visit the Google Glass Lab and spend about three hours there attending presentations and demonstrations. The hope from Google is to have their glasses used by first responders, police officers, medical personnel would be able to use it on the job and they wanted the input of the NaCO board on how these could add value to public service.

Mr. Giles stated that there is a new director at NaCO, Amelia Estrada, who came from Brookings and is the head of research for NaCO. She is doing a profile of every county in terms of economic issues. Mr. Giles has given Ms. Estrada all member email addresses. He also stated that Governor Huntsman is coming back to speak to NaCO.

Agenda
Amendment

Dr. Foust moved to amend the agenda by making second readings out of Ordinances 131 through and including Ordinance 142, and also adding the appointments of Bob Tullio to the Erie County Industrial Development Authority and Antonio Del Rio to the Drug and Alcohol Advisory Board, and also adding Ordinance Number 143 to the agenda, and moving that ordinance to a second reading. This was seconded by Mr. Fatica, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Second
Readings

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 131, 2013, "2013 Children & Youth Services Fund Budget Revised Expenditures of \$5,000 for the Creation of Expense Line Item for Court Ordered Placements". This was moved by Mr. DiMattio and seconded by Mr. Leone. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 132, 2013, "Sixth 2013 Library Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation of \$110,994 for Additional Custodial Expenditures". This was moved by Mr. Leone and seconded by Mr. Fatica. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 133, 2013, "Ninth 2013 Public Health Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation of \$86,167 for Additional Custodial Expenditures". This was moved by Mr. Leone and seconded by Dr. Foust. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 134, 2013, "Thirty-First 2013 General Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation of \$359,257 for County Facilities (Based Upon Annual Projections)". This was moved by Dr. Foust and seconded by Mr. Fatica. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

December 17, 2013

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 135, 2013, "2013 Gaming Fund Budget Revised Expenditures of \$1,053,070 and Creation of a Line Item for Library Operating Expenditures". This was moved by Mr. DiMattio and seconded by Mr. Fatica. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 136, 2013, "2013 Library Fund Budget Revised revenue of \$1,053,070 for Library Operating Expenditures. This was moved by Mr. DiMattio and seconded by Mr. Fatica. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 137, 2013, "2013 General Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation of \$1,053,070 and Creation of a Line Item for Library Operating Expenses". This was moved by Mr. DiMattio, seconded by Mr. Fatica and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 138, 2013, "2014 Revised Environmental Fee Schedule in the Erie County Department of Public Health". This was moved by Mr. Fatica, seconded by Mr. DiMattio, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 139, 2013, "2014 County Council Solicitor's Retainer". This was moved by Dr. Foust, seconded by Mr. Fatica, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 140, 2013, "2014 Appointed Official's Salary Ordinance – County Clerk". This was moved by Dr. Foust, seconded by Mr. Fatica, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 141, 2013, "2013 General Fund Budget Reorganization of Assessment Bureau Position Titles and Rates". This was moved by Dr. Foust, seconded by Mr. Leone, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a second reading of Ordinance Number 142, 2013, "Thirty-Third General Fund Budget Supplemental Appropriation of \$6,873 for Reorganization of Assessment Bureau". This was moved by Dr. Foust, seconded by Mr. Fatica, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Resolutions

Mr. Smith gave a reading of Resolution 63, 2013, "Approving Temporary Solicitor Contract Submitted by the Office of Tax Assessment/Board of Assessment Appeals". This was moved by Mrs. Loll, seconded by Mr. DiMattio, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Smith gave a reading of Resolution 64, 2013, "Approving Cooperation Agreement regarding Lord Corporation Tax Increment Financing District, as well as the First and Second Addendum to the Cooperation Agreement". This was moved by Dr. Foust and seconded by Mr. Fatica.

Dr. Foust moved to amend Resolution 64, 2013, by changing the second "Whereas" in the original resolution to read:

"Whereas the parties to the TIF Agreement have signed a Cooperation Agreement and Addenda thereto further intending to delineate and implement revisions of the TIF Agreement", and also to further amend this resolution with a second addenda as outlined in the attachment, which was given to Mr. Smith. This was seconded by Mr. Leone, and the amendment carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Giles then asked for a roll call vote on the Resolution, as amended, and it carried unanimously.

Mr. Smith gave a reading of Resolution 65, 2013, "Approving a Ten-Year Contract Between the County of Erie and the William T. Spaeder Company, Inc.". This was moved by Mrs. Loll and seconded by Mr. Fatica. Mr. Leone stated he would abstain from voting on this resolution because

the evaluation of this contract was done by a company that he works for and to be on the safe side, he would abstain from the vote. This carried in a 6-1 vote, with Mr. Leone abstaining.

Mr. Smith gave a reading of Resolution 66, 2013, "Exonerating Taxes on One Abandoned Trailer/Property in McKean Township and the General McLane School District". This was moved by Mrs. Loll and seconded by Mr. DiMattio. This resolution carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Appointments

Dr. Foust noted that any member of Council can move to pull any or all of these appointments out separately to be voted on, he moved to approve the appointment of Renee Wright to the Children & Youth Advisory Board, Bob Williams to the Erie County Redevelopment Authority, Lou Aliota to the Erie County Board of Health, James Veshecco to the Erie County Drug & Alcohol Advisory Board, reappointment of William DeLuca to the Erie County Redevelopment Authority, appointment of Owen McCormick to the Erie County Industrial Development Authority, Barbara Steele to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority, Wayne Howard to the Erie County General Authority and Erie County Community Services Financing Authority, reappointment of Charles Augustine to the Erie Regional Airport Authority, reappointment of Helen Carter-Snell to the Children and Youth Advisory Board, reappointment of Charles Peters to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority, reappointment of Earl Brown to the Erie County Agricultural Preservation Board, reappointment of Bob Tullio to the Erie County Industrial Development Authority, and reappointment of Antonio Del Rio to the Drug and Alcohol Advisory Board. This was seconded by Mr. Cleaver.

Mrs. Loll requested that the reappointment of Charles Augustine to the Erie Regional Airport Authority and reappointment of Charles Peters to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority be pulled out to vote on them separately.

Mr. DiMattio asked that the appointment of Lou Aliota to the Erie County Board of Health be tabled. This was seconded by Mr. Fatica. This carried in a 5-2 roll call vote, with Mr. Cleaver and Mr. Giles voting no.

Mrs. Loll commented that she received a memo from County Executive-Elect Dahlkemper, and quoted from this memo, "It is my preference that County Council delay this action on all until January. I would then take the time to consult with Council on any vacancies. I would like County Council to take that into consideration so I have the opportunity to appoint these and not the outgoing County Executive".

Mr. Giles then asked for a roll call vote on the original motion, which excludes the reappointment of Charles Augustine and Charles Peters at the request of Mrs. Loll. This carried in a 6-1 roll call vote, with Mrs. Loll voting no.

Mr. Giles then asked for a roll call vote regarding the reappointments of Charles Augustine to the Erie Regional Airport Authority and Charles Peters to the Erie County Gaming Revenue Authority. This carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Sale of Parcels

Dr. Foust moved to approve the Sale of Parcels from Repository for Unsold Properties at Index Numbers: 18-051-030.0-218.00, 24-012-036.4-074.46. This was seconded by Mr. Fatica and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Ord. 143, 2013

Mr. Smith gave a reading of Ordinance Number 143, 2013:

"2014 General Fund Budget Revised Expenditures of \$358,776 and New Line Items for Re-Creation of Court Computer Bureau

BE IT ENACTED by the County Council of the County of Erie pursuant to Article II Sections 3B (1), and 3B2 b of the Erie County Home Rule Charter and that these 2014 General Fund Budget revised expenditures of \$358,776 and new lines for the re-creation of the Court Computer Bureau, are hereby approved as outlined on the attached Exhibits A & B. This ordinance shall be effective

January 1, 2014.” This was moved to a second reading by Dr. Foust, seconded by Mr. Leone, and carried in a unanimous roll call vote.

Mr. Giles reminded everyone that Ordinance 143, 2013, is the resourcing to pay for outside contracts that were currently running through the court system that at the end of the day should probably be run through the administrative side, and that will be the crux of the argument going forward.

Presentations to
Mr. Giles &
Mr. Cleaver

Dr. Foust made a presentation to Mr. Cleaver. Dr. Foust stated the gift was in recognition of Mr. Cleaver’s service to Erie County Council. He commented that he has known Mr. Cleaver longer than anyone in the room as Mr. Cleaver was the manager of the Polish Foresters Club where his dad had a team. Dr. Foust commended Mr. Cleaver as a battler for his constituents on the east side of Erie County and that it has been an honor and privilege to serve with him. He wished him well and thanked him for his service to Erie County.

Mr. Cleaver thanked Dr. Foust and other members of Council, stating that it has been an enjoyable eight years, he was looking forward to a second retirement, and he will be in Florida for a while now that his Tuesdays and Thursdays have opened up. He thanked the other Council members for their hard work, and Joe Maloney, Doug Smith, Deneé Breter, and Sue Ellen Pasquale.

Mr. Leone then read a statement he wrote for Mr. Giles:

“What can be said about Joe Giles and his career as a councilman? Let’s look at his record and his history as a human being....

Many of us would criticize Joe for his vignettes and his long winded speeches at Council. However, being realistic, his reports may be long winded, but they are reports of interest to the public, even though the news media in its infinite wisdom doesn’t report them. After all, they only report negative issues.

His achievements as a Councilman will never be surpassed by any of us or any member coming. Joe not only cared for his community, but also devoted services to all of this state and also to this country. Joe has achieved leadership roles in CCAP and has been President of CCAP, along with being chair of many committees, and also on the Board of Directors of CCAP for more years than I can remember.

He did seek and won the position of national representative for the state of Pennsylvania on the board of NaCO. He was almost elected to chair, and did achieve a position in that organization, being on the Personnel Selection Committee for appointing the CEO of that organization. My congratulations on that achievement.

Many are not aware of the fact that if it wasn’t for Joe, we would still be looking to set up a Juvenile Drug Court. Yes, he is the one that is credited with that achievement, along with the Alms Cemetery, which many of us wouldn’t even know about if it wasn’t for Joe and his efforts in that area.

We have not given this Councilman the acknowledgement he deserves for these endeavors. So much for his achievements as a Councilman. How has he faired as a person, as a family oriented individual?

December 17, 2013

Joe cared for his ailing mother until her demise. Did he stop caring for his family? Absolutely not! He took care of his special needs sister until her demise. All of this was accomplished while still caring and helping people in this County, state, and country. We have not given the accolades this man deserves.

As a Councilman with more years than he has, I can honestly say I could never achieve his high level of status, as a servant of this community.

Joe's introduction to Pharmacy Cards via NaCO was helpful to those individuals that can least fend for themselves.

History won't remember Joe for his achievements. I will miss this individual because he has accomplished more than any Councilman. We all prepare ourselves for future endeavors. We cannot predict the future, and as Council members, we need to adjust to new members and future problems. I congratulate the new members and welcome them to this Council, and further hope and pray one of them can achieve the status that Mr. Giles has earned."

Mr. Leone then presented Mr. Giles with a framed picture of the statue of George Washington in Waterford, indicating, "With Respect and Deep Affection, From Your Colleagues on Erie County Council". He then congratulated Mr. Giles on his memorable career.

Mr. Giles stated that Mr. Fatica suggested last year that there be something from each of the members and Fred Olds did a photograph of a particular part of the County. Mr. DiMattio's was the statue in Waterford, Dr. Foust was the grape vineyards, Mr. Fatica was Presque Isle, Mrs. Loll was the historic carousel, Mr. Leone was St. Paul's Church, and Mr. Cleaver's was the zoo. Each of the photographs taken are being framed. He commented that the frame shop was able to find the same matting that has been done on all of the group pictures of County Council and this will be used on the area pictures that Mr. Olds has done. He stated the pictures should be done in the first part of the year. There will also be a new County Council member picture that will be done as well.

Mr. Giles then spoke of looking back at the last 32 years and where the County was then. The prison was still on the 4th floor, the library was on Perry Square, the bayfront highway wasn't there, the convention center wasn't there, and all the capital projects that the County has been involved in are fantastic. On a smaller scale, the Almshouse Cemetery was a personal project to renovate. He stated when the County was notified that they owned the property, he went out to see it and there were holes in the ground and remains poking through those holes. It looked like a farmer's field. The County went to a variety of institutions and agencies, the bricklayers union, Darlington Brick out of Pittsburgh donated the material. There was a committee set up, including Bob Austin, Leo Brunner, Brugger Funeral Home, Morton Precast, and a variety of other people who were connected so when the cemetery was re-done, it was done in new terms and contemporary style. Mr. Giles thanked Mrs. Loll for wanting to commemorate the cemetery. That picture will be placed in the County Council office. Mr. Giles noted that the names of the 2,000 people buried there are on the wall. The memorial is held on September 11th each year, and this past year there were 33 people who were left with no friend, no family, no one to remember them. He stated that when anyone goes back to the office and sees that picture, they will remember him.

Mr. Giles commented that there is a long list of things that he has had a deep and personal involvement in throughout Erie County. He said it has been a wonderful 32 years with the County, CCAP, and NaCO, along with all of the items given to him throughout his career. People ask him what he will miss the most, and very sincerely he said the people. Mr. Giles stated, "you have become a part of my life, and more and more became my family, and we have been family over those 32 years, so it isn't just simply a question of a certain amount of time or energy, it has been a joyful and fulfilling experience that we have had together in terms of what we have been able to do in a very collective way, and on a personal note, your friendship, your person will be who I will miss most". Mr. Giles spoke of the book by Leo Pisgalia called "The Fall of Freddy the Leaf", stating that it's a short children's story with a big message in that we all have to know how to let go. Freddy hangs on to the tree and won't let go and won't let go, until a great winter storm where

he finally lets go and he finds peace. He thanked everyone for all that they have been through together, for all that will be done going forward, and if there is any team he could let go from, this is the team because he knows that the team operates on a higher level and this Council sees, thinks, and feels better than any elected body he can think of, and he can't think of any better group of folks than sitting there that he can proudly call my family. He noted to the new members coming in to respect the sitting members of Council. He said they may not agree all the time but they do bring a huge amount of commitment and passion. He thanked everyone for enriching his life and gave much appreciation from the heart. He also stated that he had the highest regard for Kevin Flowers.

Mrs. Loll then commented that we are here to celebrate the colleagues moving on. She stated, "We have enjoyed working with both of you over the years and valued your opinions. It has been a treasured experience to work with you and you will be missed. Each of you brought to our Council your knowledge and experiences and this has been an appreciated benefit to our tasks and responsibilities. Whitey has always been a lot of fun to have around and I have enjoyed the time spent with him. Joe has always been someone I could bounce an idea off and get a sensible opinion. Whitey always says what he thinks and Joe always says it five times."

Dr. Foust then commented that he truly meant what he said about Mr. Cleaver earlier that he would miss his spirit and his battling spirit and felt that his type of point of view is always needed on any elected body. He further stated, "This Council, this County, and this community will truly miss your service. He did not think it is a stretch to say that there are few, if any, county commissioners across this Commonwealth that have more influence on County government than Mr. Giles, and the work that he has done on behalf of our community, on behalf of the less fortunate, always being there for those types of issues, it has been a pleasure knowing you as a friend from long ago, to being able to serve with you, and to be able to do good and faithful work for this community. I will miss you, this community will miss you, and I wish you the best of luck."

Mr. Fatica commented that Mr. Cleaver took him under his wing when he first came onto Council. He stated, "You were very patient with me about explaining about how these pay raises would go or wouldn't go and why they should, and for that I am always in debt. Also, you were the one who pushed us toward the fellowship of after we meet, it's how we voted, that's it, conversation stopped. That is always to be appreciated. We have seen what can happen with the disconnect as in Harrisburg and Washington. Joe, truly, you were a legend before I got here and you always will be a legend. History is turning a page right now and you've made a huge footprint and for that we are grateful. Thank you."

Mr. DiMattio stated that he has only been on Council one year and wanted to thank both Mr. Cleaver and Mr. Giles for the insight and information given to him, as well as the opportunity to serve. For that, he is very thankful. No one has any idea the amount of insight into the County actually sits here and we can talk about past executives, past mayors, past council members, but with Mr. Giles, Mr. Cleaver, and Mr. Leone sitting here, the course of Erie County and how it has been shaped over the last few decades has happened because of them. He thanked both of them for all that they have done.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:23 p.m.

Deneé M. Breter, Council Secretary
